Making College Affordability a Reality for California Students

PACE Annual Conference February 7, 2020 Sacramento, California







Agenda

- 1:15-2:10: Panelist presentations
- 2:10-2:25: Panelist Q&A
- 2:25-2:40: Table conversations
- 2:40-2:45: Table report out

Panelists



Tammeil Gilkerson, President of Laney College

PACE

Johanna Lacoe, Research Director, California Policy Lab

Patrick Perry, Division Chief of Policy, Research & Data, California Student Aid Commission Cecilia Rios-Aguilar, Associate Dean for Equity & Inclusion and Professor of Education, UCLA Graduate School of Education & Information Studies Faculty Director, PACE

Increasing the Take-Up of the Cal Grant

February 7, 2020

Johanna Lacoe Research Director



Process for receiving a Cal Grant



issued directly

to schools

Students submit FAFSA CSAC sends award High schools verify or CADAA by March notification letters to student GPAs deadline eligible students Students confirm their Schools confirm Cal Grant payments are chosen schools on the student enrollment WebGrants 4 Students and eligibility site

5

Cal Grants I: Randomization was conducted at the school level



Control

of schools: 806
of students: ~46K

Treatment 1 simplified letter

of schools: 795
of students: ~47K

Treatment 2: simplified letter + belonging language

of schools: 797
of students: ~45K



Cal Grants I study timeline

November 2017 CSAC begins mailing letters to students June 2018 Last letters are mailed

October 2017 The Free Application for Federal Student Aid (FAFSA) opens to students March 2018 FAFSA deadline; letters continue to go out after this date September 2018

Students enroll for the fall semester at their chosen institutions **February 2020** Expecting final data on enrollment for 2018-2019

Congratulations!

You have been awarded a preliminary Cal Grant award for the 2018-19 academic year!

Governor Edmund G. Brown Jr., the Legislature and the California Student Aid Commission (CSAC) are investing in YOU because of your academic achievements and determination. Based on the information you provided to CSAC on your Free Application for Federal Student Aid (FAFSA) or California Dream Act Application (CADAA) as well as your GPA, you have been determined to be preliminarily eligible for a Cal Grant.

Cal Grant award amounts vary by the type of college you choose to attend and enrollment status. These are the current Cal Grant maximum amounts you could receive if you enroll at an eligible California campus in the following segments:

College Segment	Maximum Cal Grant Award Amount
CaliforniaCommunity College (CCC):	\$1,672
California State University (CSU):	\$5,742*
University of California (UC):	\$12,630*
Private, Non-Profit or WASC-accredited colleges:	\$9,084*
Non-WASC accredited For-Profit Colleges:	\$4,000*

CALIFORNIA POLICY LAB

*Cal Grant B students may also receive a \$1,672 access award in addition to the amount listed above.

In addition to a Cal Grant you are potentially eligible for a Federal Pell Grant, for approximately \$ 5920 These grants, and any other financial aid that you might receive, will help you cover the costs of attending college, which include tuition and fees, food and housing, and books and supplies.

The Cal Grant and Pell Grant do not require repayment and is only one part of your financial aid package. After you are admitted, the campus financial aid office will provide a full financial aid award notice. In addition to the Cal Grant and Pell Grant, you may also be eligible for one or more of the following:

- · Institutional grants or scholarships offered at public and private colleges and universities;
- California College Promise Grant;
- Work-Study Program or Federal Student Loans;
- Other types of financial aid offered at your campus of attendance, such as private scholarships and student loans.

This is an initial Cal Grant award notification only. You must still apply for admission to the campus you plan to attend. Your college makes the final eligibility determination for Cal Grant prior to disbursing your award. For questions about final eligibility determination and disbursement dates, reach out to the financial aid office at your chosen campus.

Make California and your families proud by continuing and completing your education. Claim your Cal Grant Award by logging onto WebGrants for Students at <u>www.csac.ca.gov/mygrantinfo</u> See enclosed flyer for more information

Lupita Cortez Alcalá Executive Director

Control

letter

E1PRP2 (11/17)

PRIVACY STATEMENT: Cal Grant information for students who are 18 years of age or older, or who have attended a postsecondary institution, will only be released to parents or guardians with written authorization from the student.

First treatment letter: simplified language

Congratulations! Based on your hard work and record of academic achievement, you have been preliminarily selected to receive a **Cal Grant scholarship**. This scholarship will help you pay for the costs of college for all four years if you remain eligible. It does not need to be repaid.

Go to <u>www.csac.ca.gov/mycalgrantinfo</u> and take the first step to claim **your** scholarship! Grant ID number: CSAC ID number:

As you research different college options, remember that the Cal Grant is designed so that tuition cost doesn't determine which college you choose to attend. The maximum amounts you would receive are listed below:

College Segment	Maximum Cal Grant Award Amount	
California Community College (CCC):	\$1,672	
California State University (CSU):	\$5,742	
University of California (UC):	\$12,630	
Private, Non-Profit or WASC-accredited colleges:	\$9,084	
Non-WASC accredited For-Profit Colleges:	\$4,000	

In addition you may be eligible for a living stipend of up to \$1,672 per year, and for other grants, such as an estimated \$1170 in a Federal Pell Grant.

Good luck with your applications! You are already on your way to becoming a college graduate!

Sincerely,

Lupita Cortez Alcalá Executive Director California Student Aid Commission

E1TG12 (11/17)

PRIVACY STATEMENT: Cal Grant information for students who are 18 years of age or older, or who have attended a postsecondary institution, will only be released to parents or guardians with written authorization from the student.



CALIFORNIA

9



Dear

CALIFORNIA POLICY Congratulations! Based on your hard work and record of academic achievement, you have been preliminarily selected to LAB

receive a Cal Grant scholarship. This scholarship will help you pay for the costs of college for all four years if you remain eligible. It does not need to be repaid.

You have shown that you're the kind of person who belongs in college. We've been working hard to help you get there!

> Go to www.csac.ca.gov/calgrantinfo and take the first step to claim your scholarship! Grant ID number:

CSAC ID number:

As you research different college options, remember that the Cal Grant is designed so that tuition cost doesn't determine which college you choose to attend. The maximum amounts you would receive are listed below:

College Segment	Maximum Cal Grant Award Amount	
California Community College (CCC):	\$1,672	
California State University (CSU):	\$5,742	
University of California (UC):	\$12,630	
Private, Non-Profit or WASC-accredited colleges:	\$9,084	
Non-WASC accredited For-Profit Colleges:	\$4,000	

In addition you may be eligible for a living stipend of up to \$1,672 per year, and for other grants, such as an estimated \$ 5920 in a Federal Pell Grant.

Good luck with your applications! You are already on your way to becoming a college graduate!

Sincerely,

Lupita Cortez Alcalá Executive Director California Student Aid Commission

E1TG22 (11/17)

PRIVACY STATEMENT: Cal Grant information for students who are 18 years of age or older, or who have attended a postsecondary institution, will only be released to parents or guardians with written authorization from the student.



Effect on account creation

Creation of a WebGrants Account



Cal Grants II: 4 arms

Control

simplified + belonging letter from Cal Grants I

of schools: 639
of students: ~33K

Treatment 1

removing all belonging language

of schools: 630
of students: ~28K

Treatment 2

including language framing college as a <u>social norm</u> instead

of schools: 633
of students: ~31K

Treatment 3

adding to the control a table providing personalized <u>net price estimates</u> for public institutions listed on a student's FAFSA

of schools: 632
of students:~31K





Cal Grants II study timeline

November 2018 CSAC begins mailing letters to students June 2019 Last letters are mailed

October 2018

The Free Application for Federal Student Aid (FAFSA) opens to students March 2019 FAFSA deadline; letters continue to go out after this date September 2019

Students enroll for the fall semester at their chosen institutions **February 2020** Expecting data on fall 2019 enrollment

Control letter: simplified + belonging



Congratulations! Based on your hard work and record of academic achievement, you have been preliminarily selected to receive a **Cal Grant**. This scholarship will help you pay for the costs of college, and it does not need to be repaid.

You have shown that you're the kind of person who belongs in college. We've been working hard to help you get there!

Go to www.csac.ca.gov/2019grant and take the first step!

CSAC ID number:

As you research different college options, remember that the Cal Grant is designed so that tuition cost doesn't determine which college you choose to attend. The maximum amounts you would receive are listed below:

College Segment	Maximum Cal Grant Award Amount	
California Community College (CCC):	\$1,672	
California State University (CSU):	\$5,742	
University of California (UC):	\$12,570	
Private Nonprofit College or University:	\$9,084	
Private For-Profit College or University:	\$4,000 - \$8,056	

You are also eligible for other grants, such as an estimated \$ in a Federal Pell Grant. You can learn more about your financial aid options at <u>www.csac.ca.gov/calc</u>.

Good luck with your applications! You are already on your way to becoming a college graduate!

Sincerely,

Lupita Cortez Alcalá Executive Director California Student Aid Commission

E1PR91 (11/18)

PRIVACY STATEMENT: Cal Grant information for students who are 18 years of age or older, or who have attended a postsecondary institution, will only be released to parents or guardians with witten authorization from the student.







Dear

Congratulations! You have been preliminarily selected to receive a Cal Grant. This scholarship will help you pay for the costs of college, and it does not need to be repaid.

Go to www.csac.ca.gov/2019calgrant and take the first step!

CSAC ID number:

As you research different college options, remember that the Cal Grant is designed so that tuition cost doesn't determine which college you choose to attend. The maximum amounts you would receive are listed below:

College Segment	Maximum Cal Grant Award Amount	
California Community College (CCC):	\$1,672	
California State University (CSU):	\$5,742	
University of California (UC):	\$12,570	
Private Nonprofit College or University:	\$9,084	
Private For-Profit College or University:	\$4,000 - \$8,056	

You are also eligible for other grants, such as an estimated \$ in a Federal Pell Grant. You can learn more about your financial aid options at www.csac.ca.gov/netprice. Good luck with your applications!

Sincerely,

Lupita Cortez Alcalá

Executive Director California Student Aid Commission

E1G191 (11/18)

PRIVACY STATEMENT: Cal Grant information for students who are 18 years of age or older, or who have attended a postsecondary institution, will only be released to parents or guardians. with written authorization from the student.



Second treatment letter: social

Dear

Congratulations! Based on your hard work and record of academic achievement, you have been preliminarily selected to receive a **Cal Grant.** This scholarship will help you pay for the costs of college, and it does not need to be repaid.

Join thousands of high school seniors who have claimed their Cal Grant and are now college graduates!

Go to www.csac.ca.gov/2019award and take the first step!

CSAC ID number:

As you research different college options, remember that the Cal Grant is designed so that tuition cost doesn't determine which college you choose to attend. The maximum amounts you would receive are listed below:

College Segment	Maximum Cal Grant Award Amount	
California Community College (CCC):	\$1,672	
California State University (CSU):	\$5,742	
University of California (UC):	\$12,570	
Private Nonprofit College or University:	\$9,084	
Private For-Profit College or University:	\$4,000 - \$8,056	

You are also eligible for other grants, such as an estimated \$ in a Federal Pell Grant. You can learn more about your financial aid options at www.csac.ca.gov/cost.

Good luck with your applications! You are already on your way to becoming a college graduate!

Sincerely,

Lupita Cortez Alcalá Executive Director California Student Aid Commission

E1G291 (11/18)

PRIVACY STATEMENT: Cal Grant information for students who are 18 years of age or older, or who have attended a postsecondary institution, will only be released to parents or guardians with written authorization from the student.



Third treatment letter: net price

Congratulations! Based on your hard work and record of academic achievement, you have been preliminarily selected to receive a **Cal Grant**. This scholarship will help you pay for the costs of college, and it does not need to be repaid.

You have shown that you're the kind of person who belongs in college. We've been working hard to help you get there!

Go to www.csac.ca.gov/2019mygrant and take the first step!

CSAC ID number:

As you research different college options, remember that **the published cost of college is not necessarily the cost for you**, because of financial aid.

Based on the information you listed on your FAFSA, we estimate that you could be eligible for as much as \$27,731 in financial aid that would reduce your costs at the colleges you listed and does not need to be paid back. The back of this letter has estimates of the aid you would receive at these schools if you attend full time. You can learn more about your financial aid options at <u>www.csac.ca.gov/price</u>.

Good luck with your applications! You are already on your way to becoming a college graduate!

Sincerely,

Dear

Lupíta Cortez Alcalá Executive Director California Student Aid Commission



Third treatment letter: net price





The estimates above were created using the net price calculators on the institutions' websites. Final aid determinations are made by institutions. You can expect details of your full financial aid package from your institution once you have been admitted.

Grant aid estimates include aid from multiple sources, including the Cal Grant and other state, federal, and institutional aid programs. Grant aid does not need to be paid back. Loans or work study may also be available to help you cover costs.

Visit <u>www.csac.ca.gov/price</u> for information about institutions where estimates are not available.

net price



60%



Creation of a WebGrants Account As of April 2019



Conclusions & next steps



- Cal Grants I: The simplified letters increased account creation
- Cal Grant II: The net price and social norm letters increased account creation relative to the simplified letters, but not the simplified + belonging letters
 - The effect of letters in the second experiment on account creation was much smaller, possibly because the baseline letters were very similar to the treatment letters

• Next steps: estimate the effect of the letters on college enrollment



Thank you!

Questions: Johanna Lacoe, johanna.lacoe@berkeley.edu



Student Expenses and Resources Survey (SEARS)

Patrick Perry Director of Policy, Research, and Data







https://www.csac.ca.gov/sears



Background

CSAC creates Student Expense Budget (SEB)

- From early 1970s through 2006-07, SEB was informed by SEARS data
- Survey was administered every 3 years (on paper)
- Used by institutions for public disclosure of cost of attendance

Survey halted after 2006-07 due to budget cuts

- Since then, SEB adjusted each year using the California Consumer Price Index (CPI)
- CSAC relaunched SEARS in 2018 (web-based)



ALLOWANCE	WITH PARENTS	ON CAMPUS HOUSING	OFF CAMPUS HOUSING	
TUITION AND FEES ¹	ACTUAL INSTITUTIONAL CHARGES			
BOOKS AND SUPPLIES ²	\$1,080 PER ACADEMIC YEAR			
FOOD ³ Per Month: Per Year:	\$ 976 / MO \$ 8,780 / YR	ACTUAL INSTITUTIONAL	\$ 602 / MO \$ 5,416 / YR	
HOUSING ⁴ Per Month: Per Year:	INCLUDED IN ABOVE	CHARGES	\$ 1,240 / мо \$ 11,164 / yr	
TRANSPORTATION ⁵ Per Month: Per Year:	\$ 104 / MO \$ 938 / YR	\$ 36 / MO \$ 324 / YR	\$ 95 / MO \$ 858 / YR	
PERSONAL / MISC ⁶ Per Month: Per Year:	\$ 358 / MO \$ 3,225 / YR	\$ 290 / MO \$ 2,609 / YR	\$ 420 / MO \$ 3,784 / YR	
CHILD / DEPENDENT CARE	REASONABLE EXPENSES WITH ADEQUATE DOCUMENTATION PROVIDED BY THE STUDENT, DEPENDING UPON AGE AND NUMBER OF CHILDREN			
LOAN FEES	FOR STUDENT LOAN BORROWERS, ACTUAL OR AVERAGE LOAN ORIGINATION AND INSURANCE			
TOTAL, Excluding Allowances based on actual institutional charges Per Month: Per Year:	\$ 1,558 / MO \$ 14,023 / YR	\$ 446 / MO \$ 4,013 / YR	\$ 2,478 / MO \$ 22,302 / YR	



SEARS 2018-19

- Generous grant from College Futures Foundation to revive and revise SEARS
- Worked with Mathematica on survey design, conversion to web, marketing strategy, data collection and analysis, focus groups, and piloting
- Survey given and data collected between Fall 2018-Spring 2019
- 57 question, branched survey instrument



Survey Topics

- Housing expenses
- \circ Transportation expenses
- Miscellaneous expenses
- $\,\circ\,$ Expenses for books and supplies
- $\,\circ\,$ Food expenses and food assistance
- \circ Financial resources
- Uptake of government assistance programs
- By student background/demographics
- By higher ed segment, regional geography



Response Rate

Segment	Participating Institutions	Students Sampled	Respondents	Response Rate
AICCU	19	21,532	3,154	14.6%
CCC	55	81,157	6,608	8.1%
CSU	23	33,949	4,265	12.6%
PCC	4	1,430	137	9.6%
UC	9	12,385	1,255	10.1%
Total	110	150,453	15,419	10.2%



Priorities for Initial Analysis

How do students' reported expenses and perception of ability to meet their expenses vary for key subgroups?

- \circ Micro-region
- $\,\circ\,$ Higher education segment
- Gender
- Race/ethnicity
- $\,\circ\,$ With and without dependents
- $\,\circ\,$ Older and younger students
- Working status



What so far has been the biggest obstacle for you to be successful in college?

- Cost of college
- $\,\circ\,$ Balancing school and work responsibilities
- Balancing school and family responsibilities
- Classes are too difficult
- \circ Too little support from college
- Too little support from family
- Other obstacles
- \circ No major obstacles



Students report the **cost of attending college** and **balancing school and work** are the biggest obstacles to being successful.





Students report spending \$2,020/month for nontuition expenses associated with attending college

- Students report their expenses for books and supplies, food, housing, transportation, and personal expenses
- On average, students reported spending \$2,020 per month for expenses in those categories





1 in 3 students have experienced food or housing insecurity within the last 30 days





Housing



 75% of students age 21 and under across all segments either live on campus or with their parents.



Housing Insecurity

It's been tough and hard to eat balanced meals and have a stable place to live. I had to couch surf for several weeks and sleep in my car due to lack of money.

Student, East Bay

Housing challenges students encountered within the last 30 days:



said they did not pay the full amount of a gas, oil, or electricity bill



10%

said they did not pay or underpaid their rent or mortgage

said there was a rent or mortgage increase that made it difficult to pay



said they lived in a house or apartment with more people than were listed on the lease or rental agreement



said they moved in with others, even for a little while, because of financial problems



said they moved two times or more



said they had no consistent place to sleep (e.g. homeless, couch-surfing, living in a car/shelter)



Food





Food Insecurity

Students' level of food security was classified based on the number of affirmative responses to a set of 10 questions² and students with very low or low food security levels were considered food insecure.

I love school, And I will not eat just to pay for school.

Student, Orange County



Security

Marginal Secure

Very Low Food Security

I have not bought books/school supplies to be able to pay rent/food.

Student, Northern Inland

Overall, 22% of students reported very low food security, and 13% of students reported low food security, for a total of



of students experiencing food insecurity.


The survey asked about specific challenges students encountered with food within the last 30 days:



said they often or sometimes couldn't afford to eat balanced meals



said they often or sometimes worried food would run out



said that often or sometimes the food just didn't last and they didn't have money to get more



Of those who responded often or sometimes true to any of the above:



said they cut the size of meals or skipped meals because there wasn't enough money for food



said they ate less than they felt they should because there wasn't enough money for food



said they were hungry but didn't eat because there wasn't enough money for food



Among all students surveyed, **87%** did not receive any food assistance. Among food insecure students, **82%** did not receive any food assistance.



Region

Micro-region	Macro-region
Northern Coastal	North Far North
Northern Inland	North Far North
Greater Sacramento	North Far North
East Bay	Bay Region
North Bay	Bay Region
Mid-Peninsula	Bay Region
Santa Cruz/Monterey	Bay Region
Silicon Valley	Bay Region
Central Valley	Central
Mother Lode	Central
South Central Coast	South Central
Los Angeles	Los Angeles and Orange County
Orange County	Los Angeles and Orange County
Inland Empire/Desert	Inland Empire/Desert
San Diego/Imperial	San Diego and Imperial





Monthly Housing Expenses by Micro-region





Housing Insecurity by Micro-region

Los Angeles				31							
North Bay											
South Central Coast		32									
Northern Inland		33									
East Bay											
Santa Cruz/Monterey		33									
San Diego/Imperial		34									
Silicon Valley		35									
Orange County		35									
Northern Coastal		35									
Mother Lode		35									
Inland Empire/Desert		37									
Mid-Peninsula		38									
Greater Sacramento		41									
Central Valley		42									
	0	5 10 15 20 25 30 35 40 Percent									



Low Food Security by Micro-region



Low or very low food security



Students with dependents and students who are 25 or older report higher expenses and higher levels of insecurity

- Students with dependents face significantly higher costs compared to those without, \$3,103 vs. \$1,830 per month
- Students who are 25 and older spend around \$2,691 per month compared to \$1,734 spent by younger students
- Both older students and those with dependents report more insecurity and more challenges meeting their expenses than their counterparts

Next Steps

- Series of SEARS Research Briefs under development
 - Housing, Food Insecurity, Transportation, First-Generation Students spotlight
 - Regional breakdowns of costs

dent Aid Commission

- Cal Grant Reform Work Group
 - SEARS data will help inform priorities for financial aid reform
 - Cal Grant Reform Workgroup has completed its work and will send recommendation(s) forward to the CSAC, Governor, and Legislature (March-April)



Contact Us:

Patrick Perry Director of Policy, Research, & Data pperry@csac.ca.gov

www.csac.ca.gov



The California College Promise: A Promise to What, for Whom, and Where?

Cecilia Rios-Aguilar, UCLA

Austin Lyke, UCLA



California College Promise: What, Whom, and Where?

- Promise programs have existed since the 1950s but have proliferated in the last decade across the U.S.
- In 2017, California established its own free program called the California College Promise (AB 19) to respond to concerns about affordability as well as broader inequities that that result in lower rates of college access and attainment among the most vulnerable groups of students, including (but not limited to) low-income students, immigrant students, English language learners, students of color, first-generation students, LGBTQ students, returning veterans, and foster youth.

The Promise Landscape in California

What we learned from looking descriptively at some promise programs in CA is that:

- Promise programs in California are not necessarily universal and have tremendous variation in their definition and structure (e.g., goals, design, scope, funding, beneficiaries, etc.).
- Implementation of promise programs varies widely, depending on institutional and regional capacities and resources.
- Extensive eligibility requirements affect who can benefit from various promise programs.
- Virtually no research exists that examines the impact, efficiency, effectiveness, and equity dimensions of California's numerous promise programs.

What is the California College Promise?

The California College Promise program established through AB 19 is distinct from existing state financial aid sources in that it provides districts/colleges with funds to waive some or all tuition and fees for a significant subset of students (i.e., first-time, full-time students who complete a financial aid application) if the district chooses to use funds for student financial aid.

How are Colleges Implementing AB 19?

- In 2018–19, 105 colleges received AB 19 funds. This number is expected to grow in the next years. Of those colleges, 65 institutions awarded financial aid to students using AB 19 funds.
- Programs are relatively new—56 percent of them have only existed for one or two years.
- Most students benefitting from AB 19 are first-time, full-time students.
- Colleges are using funds in a variety of ways. The top three spending categories include: tuition and/or fees, hiring of staff, and educational costs (most commonly textbook vouchers, transportation assistance, and food vouchers)
- Colleges are combining various streams of funding (e.g., AB 19 with the Student-Centered Funding Formula) to provide comprehensive supports for students.
- Colleges report significant equity concerns, specifically that students benefitting from the program are not the ones who need it most (e.g., low-income students of color).

A Promise to What and for Whom?

Figure 2. Total Award Amounts by Race/Ethnicity



Award:

California College Promise (AB19) Fee Waiver Other Grant: California College Promise (AB19) Source

Policy Analysis for California Education

Figure 3. Average Awards by Race/Ethnicity



PACE

Policy Analysis for California Education

Where?

Figure 4. Geography of AB 19 Funds Awarded in California **Figure 5.** Geography of AB 19 Funds Awarded in LA County

 Over 40 per allocated de four Califor Orange

PACE



Recommendations

- · Revise eligibility criteria
- Invest in a public campaign to clarify what is being promised and to whom
- Invest in studies that examine the impact, efficiency, effectiveness, and equity dimensions of the program

Panelist Q&A



Tammeil Gilkerson, President of Laney College

PACE

Johanna Lacoe, Research Director, California Policy Lab

Patrick Perry, Division Chief of Policy, Research & Data, California Student Aid Commission Cecilia Rios-Aguilar, Associate Dean for Equity & Inclusion and Professor of Education, UCLA Graduate School of Education & Information Studies Faculty Director, PACE

Table conversation

- Introductions
 - Your name & role
- Discussion questions
 - What messages need to be sent to students, families, and communities about the current initiatives (at both state and local levels) to address issues of college affordability?
 - How can policy-makers and institutions ensure that programs/financial aid/grants/scholarships will reach vulnerable and marginalized groups of students?
 - How can we strengthen partnerships across regions to support existing efforts to address issues of college affordability?

Group Shareout

Policy Analysis for California Education

Next up...!

- Quick break: coffee, tea, and snacks
- Be back downstairs in the Magnolia Ballroom by **3:00pm** for the closing keynote: *Paul Tough*